

City of Mississauga Corporate Report



<p>Date: December 1, 2021</p> <p>To: Chair and Members of General Committee</p>	<p>Originator's files:</p>
<p>From: Paul Mitcham, P.Eng, MBA, City Manager and Chief Administrative Officer</p>	<p>Meeting date: January 12, 2022</p>

Subject

A Review of the City's Asset Naming Policies Through an Equity, Diversity and Inclusion Lens

Recommendation

1. That the recommended approach to review the City's asset naming policies through an equity, diversity, and inclusion lens, as outlined in this report entitled "A Review of the City's Asset Naming Policies Through an Equity, Diversity and Inclusion Lens" dated December 1, 2021 be approved.
2. That the Council-imposed moratorium on adding new street names to the Street Name Reserve List continue until a revised naming policy is approved.
3. That the Mayor, on behalf of Council, write to the federal and provincial governments as well as the Federation of Canadian Municipalities (FCM) and the Association of Municipalities of Ontario (AMO) to request their support (financial and legislative) and guidance on this issue that is national in scope.
4. That a new capital project PN 22-862 "City Assets Naming Policy Review Through An EDI Lens" be established with a gross and net budget of \$130,000 and that funding be allocated from Capital Reserve Fund Account #33121.
5. That all necessary by-laws be enacted.

Executive Summary

- In September 2020, on receipt of a petition with 14,000 signatures calling for the renaming of Dundas Street, the City of Toronto undertook a review of the history of Henry Dundas using third party expertise (Equity Diversity Inclusion (EDI) consultants, historians, and academics). Following this initial review of Dundas Street, in July 2021, Toronto Council directed staff to:

- Rename Dundas Street and all associated assets bearing his name
- Develop principles for commemoration in the public realm
- Convene a community advisory committee to provide input on recognition and commemoration
- Develop a transition plan to support residents and business along Dundas Street
- On June 30, 2021, Mississauga Council passed resolution 0156-2021 directing staff to review and report to General Committee outlining the scope and proposed work plan for the review of street naming and renaming, and the public art policy related to historic names and figures.
- Subsequent to Council Resolution 156-2021, the Ontario Human Rights Commission (OHRC) published proposed content for a policy on the discriminatory display of names, words and images to recognize the enduring impact of colonialism and increase awareness of negative impacts on individuals and groups. Once the OHRC has affirmed this policy (likely in 2022), it will guide municipalities on how to comply with the Human Rights Code.
- On October 13, 2021, City Council adopted the Governance Committee's recommendation GC-0516-2021, which states that no further street names be added to the Street Name Reserve List until the diversity review is completed by the City Manager's Office.
- In response to these two Council resolutions, staff recommend the following approach:
 - Conduct a review of the City's asset naming and recognition policies through an EDI lens to develop guiding principles for asset namings, and further refine the existing seven asset naming policies, using third-party expertise and engaging in targeted consultation. The cost for this review is approximately \$130,000;
 - Use the Draft Seven Principles for Commemoration in the Public Realm from the City of Toronto to review street names submitted for use in new developments in the short term; and
 - Not pursue a review of existing named public assets, including Dundas Street, until such time as new commemoration and recognition policies are developed for the City of Mississauga.
- The issue of naming and renaming municipal public infrastructure through an EDI lens will affect every municipality in Canada and the financial burden alone is significant. As such, staff recommend the Mayor, on behalf of Council, request the federal and provincial governments provide guidance, support and financial assistance for municipalities that choose to undertake a review and rename existing infrastructure, including streets, public art and facilities.

Background

City of Toronto Recognition Review

In June 2020, Toronto's City Council received a petition signed by close to 14,000 individuals calling for Dundas Street to be renamed, citing its namesake Henry Dundas' role in delaying the abolition of the trans-Atlantic slave trade.

In September 2020, Toronto City Council approved a consultation and research plan to explore options to respond to the petition, which included:

- Doing nothing and maintaining the status quo;
- Maintaining current street names but including an additional interpretation;
- Maintaining current street names but change the names of other civic assets bearing the Dundas name; and
- Undertaking a full renaming of streets and civic assets bearing the Dundas name.

Toronto City staff began with consultations, not with the wider community, but with those groups most impacted. They centred the work on equity deserving communities. In consultation with these communities, staff developed guiding principles to inform their Commemorations and Recognitions review. A key objective of Toronto's Recognition Review is to examine and respond to how systemic racism and discrimination may be embedded in place names and City assets.

Throughout their review, Toronto received over 400 case studies and engaged with 20 academics from around the world. They dedicated a team of 50 people for this project, 27 of whom have been meeting every week for over a year. Toronto has 44 divisions, and 14 of them are involved in this project. The scope of their review was not just Dundas Street, but all streets within the City. To date, 60 streets have been deemed problematic and in need of further review. The cost just to rename Dundas Street in Toronto is estimated at \$5.1M - \$6.3M.

In July 2021, Toronto's City Council directed staff to:

- Proceed with the renaming of Dundas Street and other City assets bearing this name;
- Develop principles for Commemoration in the Public Realm and recommendations for a new commemorations framework and implementation plan;
- Convene a Community Advisory Committee made up of representatives from the diverse communities, Business Improvement Areas and Residents Associations represented along Dundas Street. The Committee will develop and seek community input on potential new names;
- Develop a transition plan to support Dundas Street residents and businesses impacted by the name change;
- Prepare a full cost recovery program related to changing the name of Dundas Street for any business, regardless including tangible costs related to rebranding and/or exterior signage;
- Mandate that City divisions and agencies are to include costs related to renaming Dundas Street as part of their 2022 and 2023 Budget submissions.

A report of the broader review will be brought to the Executive Committee in the second quarter of 2022.

Jurisdictional Scan

As part of its Recognition Review, the City of Toronto undertook a jurisdictional scan. The following is taken from the City of Toronto website as of November 2021:

- The Dundas renaming petition is one of many global efforts currently underway to confront anti-Black racism and discrimination against other communities. In order to identify best practices, staff are actively monitoring global developments to understand how other jurisdictions are responding to proposals to rename streets and facilities, and requests to remove monuments.
- As of May 31, 2021, 430 case studies from 2017 to 2020 have been identified, drawn from Canada, the U.S., the U.K., Germany, Spain and Australia.
- 129 municipalities changed a street/public asset name (Montreal, Halifax); 37 did not (Kitchener); 2 added interpretive plaques
- 13 municipalities issued anti-racism statements (including the City of Mississauga's Resolution 207 regarding anti-Black and Indigenous systemic racism)
- 15 are looking into a variety of ways to honour Indigenous and equity-deserving communities (Halifax)
- 47 established advisory committees, and 135 included public consultation (Halifax, Winnipeg)
- 178 removed monuments (Victoria, Regina, Halifax); 26 kept monuments but added or plan to add new interpretative plaques or make other modifications (Kingston); 17 kept monuments and made no further changes

Proposed Ontario Human Rights Commission Policy on the Discriminatory Display of Names, Words and Images

In September 2021, the Ontario Human Rights Commission (OHRC) published proposed content for inclusion in a policy statement on the discriminatory display of names, words and images. The purpose of the policy statement is to:

- Recognize the enduring impact of colonialism on Indigenous peoples and Ontario's historical links to slavery by promoting awareness about the negative impacts the discriminatory display of names and images has on individuals and groups;
- Promote understanding and compliance with legal obligations under the Code, including the duty to respond, investigate and resolve allegations of discrimination;
- Set out a human rights-based analysis and procedure framework for dealing with issues in the community and before tribunals and courts;
- Encourage municipalities and other obligated organizations to develop their own policies through community input; and
- Help avoid situations that may lead to discrimination or a poisoned environment.

If approved by the OHRC, the policy would apply to:

- Organizations that provide services within the meaning of section 1 of the Human Rights Code (the Code), including provincial and municipal governments, public and private sector organizations; and
- Discriminatory situations, involving the display of words and images, including names, terms, descriptions, depictions, symbols and other markers used for, but not limited to: street and road names; geographic areas, landmarks, buildings and outdoor facilities; commemorative statues, plaques and days; sports teams and their mascots; events; or other similar uses.

According to the draft overview, the policy will guide municipalities in meeting obligations of the Code in examining names, terms and images that might involve current or historic persons known for their discriminatory views and actions or links to discriminatory views or actions. Furthermore, Mississauga could be required to re-evaluate names, terms and images that might also represent or negatively appropriate the culture of groups such as Indigenous peoples or racialized communities protected by grounds of the Code. An outline of the proposed OHRC policy positions can be found in Appendix 1. The final policy will be released some time in 2022.

City of Mississauga Council Resolutions

Prompted by Toronto Council's then pending decision, on June 30, 2021, Mississauga Council passed resolution 0156-2021 directing staff to:

“Review and report back to General Committee in the fall of 2021 outlining the scope and proposed work plan for the review of street naming/renaming and the public art policy related to historic names and figures due to concerns raised by the community and actions being undertaken by the City of Toronto.”

To date, the City has only received six emails and four phone enquiries on the topic of equitable, diverse and inclusive (EDI) street namings. The enquiries were received through the Mayor's and Councillors' Offices and the 311 Citizen Contact Center. The enquiries related to seven streets:

- Acorn Place
- Clansman Trail
- Colonial Drive
- Duke of York Boulevard
- Dundas Street East and West
- Indian Road
- Winston Churchill Boulevard

Collectively, there are over 7500 properties including residences, businesses, not-for profit organizations, places of religious assembly located along these streets that may be potentially affected by any decisions on the respective street names.

Subsequent to Mississauga Council passing resolution 0156-2021 in June 2021, Council passed Resolution GC-0516-2021 on October 13, 2021, which reads:

“That no further street names be added to the Street Name Reserve List until the Diversity review is completed by the City Manager’s Office” (GC-0516-2021).

The following report is a response to both resolutions of Council. It outlines a plan to review how the City names its assets, including street names, facilities, public art, and parks through an EDI lens.

Comments

City of Mississauga Current Street Naming Policy

At present, there are 162 names on the current Street Name Reserve List. Some names on the list date back 30 years and the review process for their addition to the list is unknown. The current process for naming streets is as follows:

- If proposed as part of a development application, the name will be sent to the Region of Peel Street Names Committee for review and approval. The Committee reviews the name from the perspective of ease of provision of emergency services and considers such things as duplication of street names, potential for spelling errors and ease of pronunciation. If approved at the Region, it will then be sent to Mississauga City Council for approval.
- Names are not permitted if they:
 - Conflict with existing street names
 - Discriminate against people in accordance with Ontario Human Rights Code
 - Damage the image of the City and its employees
 - Are likely to cause deep or widespread offence
 - Are named after a business or industry
 - Cause any confusion to emergency services
- Approved street names that are not used straight away are added to a reserve list for future use within the City

To date, the City of Mississauga has not applied an equity, diversity and inclusion (EDI) lens to any of the names on this list. At this time, there is no division in the City with the required competency and capacity to undertake a comprehensive review of existing street names on the registry. External expertise would be necessary to review the entire registry of names and provide recommendations on policy changes to facilitate ongoing review.

City of Mississauga Asset Naming Policies

At present, asset naming in Mississauga is governed by seven policies:

1. Street Names – Policy #10-02-01
2. City Plaques - Policy # 06-01-03
3. Tree and Bench Donation Program – Policy #05-07-02
4. Collections Policy 05-01-11
5. City Acquired Art Policy _ 05-02-07
6. Facility Naming - Policy #05-02-02
7. Use of Indigenous Images/Themes in City Sports Facilities – Policy #08-03-08

To date, there has been no assessment of these policies through an EDI lens.

City of Toronto Draft Principles for Commemoration in the Public Realm

As part of Toronto's Recognition Review, staff have drafted seven Principles for Commemoration of the Public Realm to be used when naming new assets or renaming existing assets. Staff are currently seeking public feedback on these guiding principles:

1. **Indigenous Place-Keeping**
2. **Co-Creation**
3. **Demonstrated Community Support and Engagement**
4. **Relevance to the City of Toronto**
5. **Celebrating Untold Stories**
6. **Historical and Community Research**
7. **Compliance with Legislation, City By-Laws and Policies**

According to the City of Toronto, the Principles for Commemoration in the Public Realm will guide the development, review and application of City policies and programs related to commemoration through tangible physical assets on City property. This includes policies and programs related to the naming and renaming of streets, parks, community centres and other civic facilities along with the acquisition of new and stewardship of existing commemorative works in the City's public art and monuments collection, and interpretive plaque programs.

Despite the Council imposed moratorium on adding new names, in July 2021, Toronto Council did approve the naming of Freemon Redmon Circle and used the seven principles to evaluate the name. It is a good case study of how the criteria can be applied and how Mississauga could use these draft criteria to evaluate the approximately 30 street names on the City's Street Name Registry for short term needs. This case study and application of the draft guiding principles can be found in Appendix 2.

A Review of Dundas Street in Mississauga

As per Council Resolution 0156-2021, staff undertook a review of the costs associated with reviewing and renaming Dundas Street, based on the resources needed for undertaking a similar review to that of the City of Toronto. To undertake the public consultation and engagement, as well as engage the necessary expertise, the projected cost to conduct a review of Dundas Street is approximately \$540,000, based on the experience of the City of Toronto.

As in Toronto, this review could produce a number of outcomes, from providing education about the history of Dundas, to a full renaming of all City assets that bear the Dundas name. If the latter option was chosen, the cost to physically rename all assets bearing the Dundas name in Mississauga would be approximately \$1.3 million. This is based on the costs to residents and businesses associated with the name change, as well as the need to replace physical assets like street signs. The following is an estimate of the costs involved:

Description	Estimated Costs
MiWay Transit costs (includes changes to bus shelters, signage, and information technology)	\$83,950
Works Operations and Maintenance costs (includes changes to street and highway directional guide signs, wayfinding signage, and costs for materials, fabrication and labour)	\$99,000
Engagement and Communication costs (media relations, social media, advertising, translation, engagement, video/photography, AV support, printing, mail)	\$115,000
Compensation to residents and non-residents (businesses, religious organizations, not-for-profit) based on provisions in the Street Names policy	\$1,005,000
Total Estimated Cost	\$1,277,000

A full breakdown of the actions involved in renaming Dundas Street can be found in Appendix 5. The costs associated with renaming other potentially problematic streets cannot be known at this time as they have not yet been identified.

Recommended Approach

The City of Toronto began their Recognition Review by focusing on Dundas Street, as per the petition received with over 14,000 signatures. Their initial review and consultation on Dundas Street lasted close to one year and involved multiple divisions and consultants, as outlined above. While Mississauga has to date not received the same number of requests to review existing street names, such as Dundas Street, there is still a need to address the principles of Resolution 207 from 2020 which states:

“The City of Mississauga reaffirms its commitment to address systemic racism and discrimination by creating and supporting policies and programs that address the inequities that Indigenous Peoples, racialized communities, and in particular, Black communities continue to experience in the City of Mississauga.”

To honour the intent of this resolution, in particular addressing systemic racism, staff recommend conducting a review of our asset naming policies, in particular our street naming policy, through an EDI lens. The goal will be to develop a set of guiding principles for recognition and commemoration, as well as a set of asset naming policies built on these principles, that will ensure the City undertakes proper due diligence and an EDI assessment when deciding upon new asset names.

Staff recommend approaching the work in two phases:

Phase 1

1. **Immediate Need to Name Streets in New Developments** – Using the City of Toronto’s seven Draft Principles for Commemoration in the Public Realm to review street names submitted for new developments in Mississauga that are needed in the short-term. Approximately 30 such names are needed.
2. **Naming Policy Review** – Using internal resources and external expertise, review and refine the existing naming and recognition policies for City assets through targeted consultation and the use of independent expertise – Mississauga’s own ‘Commemoration and Recognition Review.’

Phase 2

3. **Consider Reviewing Dundas Street and Existing Named Assets** - Following the outcome of this review and refinement of existing asset naming policies, as well as the development of guiding principles for future asset namings, staff and Council will be in a better position to make a decision on renaming existing city assets, including Dundas Street.

This approach will allow the City to develop a comprehensive framework and guiding principles needed to address current and future recognition and commemoration needs, as well as lay the foundation for a retroactive review of existing assets, if Council chooses to do so. It will also allow staff time to better understand resource implications of a larger review, as the policy environment is continuing to change.

In total, the City of Mississauga owns 3530 named public streets including highways, 374 buildings and facilities including arenas and Museums, and 158 commemoratively named parks and 18 items in its art collection including monuments and other public art.

Phase 1

Immediate Need to Name Streets in New Developments

To address the immediate pressure of naming approximately 30 streets in new developments, Strategic Initiatives and Communications will convene a working group comprised of the new Employee Equity Advisory Committee and staff from appropriate service areas to provide a more in-depth review of proposed street names. To complete this review, staff will engage with the necessary third-party experts, depending on the names chosen.

This working group will use the Draft Principles for Commemoration in the Public Realm City of Toronto as a guide for this work. Toronto staff have done significant due diligence and consultation to develop their seven guiding principles. While OHRC has not finalized its policy, their draft principles will be consulted as part of this exercise. The OHRC proposed policy guidelines combined with the draft principles from the City of Toronto, while not made-in-Mississauga, will act as a good guide foundation to undertake this short term work.

At the same time, there may be a need for park and other facility naming as the review is undertaken. Staff recommend using the same draft guiding principles from the City of Toronto along with the OHRC proposed policy guidelines to review proposed names should the need arise. At the end of the broader review, all asset policies at the City of Mississauga will be updated to reflect the new Council-approved guiding principles and direction.

City Asset Naming Policy Review

Staff will engage in targeted consultation, especially with equity deserving groups, to develop the Mississauga-specific guiding principles that will underpin new asset naming policies. The scope of this review will include how names are proposed, how they are reviewed, the criteria and guiding principles that are applied to each name, and how they are finally approved.

Staff recommend the following process to conduct a City Asset Naming Policy Review through an EDI lens:

1. Convene an interdivisional working group of relevant staff from across the organization, as well as the Employee Equity Advisory Committee and the Diversity and Inclusion Advisory Committee;
2. Review the seven existing policies that govern asset naming, as well as City by-laws
3. Engage independent expertise to develop the guiding principles for asset naming, including targeted consultation with leaders from the Black, Indigenous communities and equity deserving groups;
4. Develop Mississauga's guiding principles for recognition and commemoration;
5. Develop a revised policy framework for City asset naming;
6. Test draft policy direction through targeted public consultation, with a focus on equity-deserving groups; and
7. Provide recommendations to Council on a revised policy and guiding principles, as well as an implementation plan.

This approach allows the application of an EDI perspective to current naming practices and, with representative input from impacted communities, provides even stronger criteria to augment asset naming in Mississauga in the future.

The estimated cost to conduct a review is \$104K - \$127K (rounded) for approximately a 6-month duration, depending on availability of required expertise. Included are costs to hire third party vendors to lead the development of guiding principles and revision of naming policies and costs for public engagement.

Phase 2

Staff recommend not proceeding with a review of existing named assets, including Dundas Street and other potentially problematic streets and assets, until such time as the work in Phase 1 is complete. At that time, staff will be in a better position to make a recommendation to Council on whether to proceed with renaming, based on a revised policy and robust public consultation. The work done in Phase 1 could act as a foundation for such a review.

Strategic Plan

The recommendations in this report support the strategic pillars Connect and Prosper.

Financial Impact

A new capital project PN 22-862 is to be established with a Gross and net budget of \$130,000 as outlined below.

Description	Estimated Costs
Naming Policy Review and Development of Guiding Principles by Independent EDI Consultants	\$60,000 - \$70,000
Communication and Engagement Costs	\$30,000 - \$40,000
Estimated Cost	\$90,000 - \$110,000
Contingency 15%	\$13,500 - \$16,500
Total Estimated Cost	\$103,500 - \$126,500

Conclusion

The renaming of assets that honour potentially problematic and even racist historical figures is a discussion that many institutions are having and will be forced to have in the years ahead. As a progressive organization committed to equity, the City of Mississauga has an obligation to engage with equity deserving and racialized communities to build a community where everyone belongs.

The names given to public assets like streets confer an honour upon those named. At present, the City does not have a consistent policy for recognition and commemoration of public assets and has not yet undertaken a review of these policies through an equity, diversity, and inclusion lens. Staff therefore recommend conducting this review first, before any decisions are made with respect to reviewing already named city assets, as the City of Toronto did with Dundas Street.

This process will take some time. It is important to build strong policies that will guide how the City confers recognition through City assets now and in the future, before embarking on a review of already named assets. This project is an important step on the City's equity, diversity and inclusion journey.

Attachments

Appendix 1: Proposed Ontario Human Rights Commission Policy on the Discriminatory Display of Names, Words and Images

Appendix 2: City of Toronto Draft Guiding Principles for Commemoration in the Public Realm and their application to the naming of Freemon Redmon Circle, 2021

Appendix 3: Actions involved in the renaming of Dundas Street in Mississauga



Paul Mitcham, P.Eng, MBA, City Manager and Chief Administrative Officer

Prepared by: *Robert Trewartha, Director of Strategic Communications and Initiatives*