# **Protecting Space for Culture:** Banquet halls as sites of intangible cultural heritage in Mississauga

Sneha Mandhan, PhD Candidate, Geography and Planning University of Toronto -

- Introduction to my research
- Introduction to relevant heritage-related concepts and values
- Sharing stories of banquet halls
- Potential challenges/barriers to protecting banquet halls
- Conclusion

- Literature review
- Policy analysis
- Site visits to event spaces
- Personal in-person, phone, and virtual interviews conducted between 2020-2023 with:
  - First and second generation South Asian immigrants
  - Banquet hall owners and operators catering predominantly to South Asian communities
  - Heritage planning staff

## **Ontario Heritage Act**

#### **Ontario Heritage Act**

6.1

#### **ONTARIO REGULATION 9/06**

#### CRITERIA FOR DETERMINING CULTURAL HERITAGE VALUE OR INTEREST

#### Consolidation Period: From January 1, 2023 to the e-Laws currency date.

Last amendment: 569/22.

Francais

Legislative History: 569/22.

#### This is the English version of a bilingual regulation.

#### Criteria, s. 27 (3) (b) of the Act

1. (1) The criteria set out in subsection (2) are prescribed for the purposes of clause 27 (3) (b) of the Act. O. Reg. 569/22, s. l.

(2) Property that has not been designated under Part IV of the Act may be included in the register referred to in subsection 27 (1) of the Act on and after the day subsection 3 (2) of Schedule 6 to the *More Homes Built Faster Act, 2022* comes into force if the property meets one or more of the following criteria for determining whether it is of cultural heritage value or interest:

- The property has design value or physical value because it is a rare, unique, representative or early example of a style, type, expression, material or construction method.
- 2. The property has design value or physical value because it displays a high degree of craftsmanship or artistic merit.
- 3. The property has design value or physical value because it demonstrates a high degree of technical or scientific achievement.
- The property has historical value or associative value because it has direct associations with a theme, event, belief, person, activity, organization or institution that is significant to a community.
- The property has historical value or associative value because it yields, or has the potential to yield, information that contributes to an understanding of a community or culture.
- The property has historical value or associative value because it demonstrates or reflects the work or ideas of an architect, artist, builder, designer or theorist who is significant to a community.
- 7. The property has contextual value because it is important in defining, maintaining or supporting the character of an area.
- 8. The property has contextual value because it is physically, functionally, visually or historically linked to its surroundings.
- 9. The property has contextual value because it is a landmark. O. Reg. 569/22, s. 1.

(3) For clarity, subsection (2) does not apply in respect of a property that has not been designated under Part IV but was included in the register as of the day subsection 3 (2) of Schedule 6 to the *More Homes Built Faster Act, 2022* comes into force. O. Reg. 569/22, s. 1.



### DESIGNATING HERITAGE PROPERTIES

A Guide to Municipal Designation of Individual Properties Under the Ontario Heritage Act

Ontario Heritage Tool Kit



https://www.ontario.ca/laws/regulation/060009

## Design or physical value

- The property has design value or physical value because it is a rare, unique, representative or early example of a style, type, expression, material or construction method.
- The property has design value or physical value because it displays a high degree of craftsmanship or artistic merit.
- The property has design value or physical value because it demonstrates a high degree of technical or scientific achievement.

## Historical or associative value

- The property has historical value or associative value because it has direct associations with a theme, event, belief, person, activity, organization or institution that is significant to a community.
- The property has historical value or associative value because it yields, or has the potential to yield, information that contributes to an understanding of a community or culture.
- The property has historical value or associative value because it demonstrates or reflects the work or ideas of an architect, artist, builder, designer or theorist who is significant to a community.

## **Contextual value**

- The property has contextual value because it is important in defining, maintaining or supporting the character of an area.
- The property has contextual value because it is physically, functionally, visually or historically linked to its surroundings.
- The property has contextual value because it is a landmark.

## Intangible cultural heritage

"Intangible cultural heritage" is defined at Article 2(1) of the 2003 UNESCO Intangible Cultural Heritage Convention as the practices, representations, expressions, knowledge, skills – as well as the instruments, objects, artefacts and cultural spaces associated therewith – that communities, groups and, in some cases, individuals recognize as part of their cultural heritage. This intangible cultural heritage, transmitted from generation to generation, is constantly recreated by communities and groups in response to their environment, their interaction with nature and their history, and provides them with a sense of identity and continuity, thus promoting respect for cultural diversity and human creativity.

The Convention goes on to note at Article 2(2) that intangible cultural heritage is manifested inter alia in the following domains:

(a) oral traditions and expressions, including language as a vehicle of the intangible cultural heritage;

### (b) performing arts;

(c) social practices, rituals and festive events; (

d) knowledge and practices concerning nature and the universe;

(e) traditional craftsmanship.

(Ross, 2019, p.28)

# Intangible cultural heritage

The Burra Charter of 2013 emphasizes the importance of intangible cultural heritage and the role of citizens in the identification and management of places of cultural significance.

### The Canadian Register of Historic Places has adopted the Burra Charter's definition of heritage value/cultural significance:

"The aesthetic, historic, scientific, cultural, social or spiritual importance or significance for past, present, or future generations" As the Burra Charter 's "Practice Note: Understanding and Assessing Cultural Significance" warns:

A place can be culturally significant regardless of its age, notions of conventional beauty, or the presence or absence of built form, or the number of people for whom it is significant. A place does not have to be "old" to be historically or socially significant, nor conventionally beautiful to be aesthetically significant. Places with no visible physical evidence can still be highly significant. In assessing cultural significance, it is essential to be open to knowledge and values expressed from different perspectives and cultural contexts. Be prepared to conduct deeper research beyond "the mainstream" As communities diversify and cultures are shared across the globe, there has been a move toward gathering, protecting and featuring intangible heritage elements. Intangible heritage includes many aspects of a community's culture that are not represented by traditional physical artifacts, buildings or monuments such as: storytelling, skill sharing and knowledge building. Often these intangibles are created, transmitted and maintained organically by a community without a realization that they are explicitly maintaining culture and heritage. Rapidly changing demographics in many communities have pushed organizations and groups to document these intangibles for future communities as well as for cross-cultural learning and understanding. Many museums and galleries are using technologies to collect, archive and exhibit their local intangible heritage assets.

(Mississauga Culture Master Plan, 2019, p21)

## Living heritage

Living Heritage: the recognition of people as connected to their heritage, defined more broadly than physical components to include cultural expressions and practices. Living heritage honours the unique importance of each human life of the past, present and future, and is an inclusive concept that recognizes the desire to connect with others and share our stories.

(Mississauga Culture Master Plan 2019)

The meaning of "heritage value" encompasses more than that which is currently being applied in Canadian cities like Toronto. As Gail Higginbottom and Philip Tonner warn, even though a cultural site may seem at present to be of little relevance, this "does not mean it won't have any for future generations, who could well be astonished as to why we allowed the destruction of places that presently 'do not appear to have any value to anyone.'

(Ross, 2019, p184)

## Mississauga Culture Master Plan, 2019

### Priority 4: Support an Authentic Cultural Identity that is Welcoming, Inspiring and Enriching

#### Why is this important?

Mississauga has a rich history including early geology, First Nations heritage, European settlement and recent decades of modern settlement.<sup>34</sup> As Mississauga continues to grow, it is important to recognize and honour the past, present and the future. Mississauga's heritage should not be an elite concept but rather inclusive and available to everyone. Cities must reinvent the way they support heritage and redefine it as more than just landmarks but rather intangible and living aspects of culture and heritage.

Heritage is constantly evolving and changing and everyone is an active member of honouring, sharing and defining history. Arts, culture and heritage are key to fostering a common identity that is we coming, respectful and allows for learning. Respecting the post and the present will lead to the creation of more inclusive spacer and experiences.

#### What the community said:

Celebrate and honour Mississauga's history and living heritage: Participants wanted stronger protection for heritage sites and structures, as well as a way to celebrate the history of local neighbourhoods. It was equally important to acknowledge the evolving and changing narratives that make Mississauga unique and to acknowledge, interpret and reinterpret Mississauga's history, stories and living heritage.

Support Indigenous history and culture: A key component to supporting cultural identity involves acknowledging Mississauga's Indigenous history and culture, and enhancing the visibility of the many Indigenous and First Nations people that have a connection to Mississauga as their home, including the Mississaugas of the Credit

34 Culture Division. Heritage Management Strategy. (2016 p. 20).

First Nation. Participants wanted more focus on, and celebration of, Indigenous peoples, their culture, history and how they are connected to Mississauga's history.

The Peel Aboriginal Network, the Mississaugas of the Credit First Nation and the Huron-Wendat Nation expressed a desire to build stronger relationships with the City and Indigenous communities. It is important to educate people about Indigenous history and to use arts and culture to begin the process of reconciliation through education, information sharing, awareness building and to enhance the visibility of Indigenous peoples, cultures and histories.

### Build a cultural identity: Mississauga is transitioning from a suburban community to an increasingly urban and highly divorse cit

Participants said t Mississauga's dive

Support of the cu Participants wante reflected in the cu opportunity to incl LGBTQ2S commu bring diverse grou highlight, showcas intersectional exp Celebrate and honour Mississauga's history and living heritage:

Participants wanted stronger protection for heritage sites and structures, as well as a way to celebrate the history of local neighbourhoods. It was equally important to acknowledge the evolving and changing narratives that make Mississauga unique and to acknowledge, interpret and reinterpret Mississauga's history, stories and living heritage.

#### What the City

#### Create inclusive spaces and highlight diversity:

As the city continues to mature, it is important to support the development of a unique cultural identity for Mississauga and its residents. It is important to share information about history, diverse cultures and living heritage through a wide range of events, festivals and cultural programs. By creating more inclusive City spaces through diversity of programming at the museums and other cultural facilities, and by highlighting performing and visual arts disciplines of non-Eurocentric cultures, the City will be able to build a collective cultural identity that is unique to Mississauga.

https://www.mississauga.ca/publication/culture-master-plan/

## Mississauga Heritage Management Strategy, 2016

Several of these recommendations are highly innovative and will position the municipality as one of the leaders in Canada in terms of heritage management. The most innovative attributes include:

 an expansive understanding of what constitutes heritage. Our definition includes tangible and intangible aspects; stories that are personal, family-focused and collective; and involves the past, present and future – as shown below:





## Evolving policy landscape: Bill 23, More Homes Built Faster Act, 2022

### Decision details

Changes to the <u>OHA</u> made under the *More Homes Built Faster Act, 2022* (Bill 23) and regulatory changes to <u>O. Reg.</u> 9/06 and <u>O. Reg.</u> 385/21 are required to implement the legislative changes came into effect on January 1, 2023. The amendments are as follows:

### Listing:

- Most of the changes to procedures related to municipal registers, including the process and requirements around removal and inclusion of non-designated properties on the municipal registers.
- Changes to <u>O. Reg.</u> 9/06 Criteria for Determining Cultural Heritage Value or Interest to establish that non-designated properties included on a municipal register must meet one or more of the criteria outlined in the regulation.
- Please note: the requirement for municipalities to make their municipal registers available on a publicly accessible website will not come into force until July 1, 2023 to provide municipalities with time to ensure compliance.

#### **Designation:**

- Limiting the ability to issue a Notice of Intention to Designate on a property subject to a prescribed event to only those properties included on a municipal register.
- Changes to <u>O. Reg.</u> 9/06 Criteria for Determining Cultural Heritage Value or Interest to establish that a property must meet two or more criteria in the regulation in order to be designated. The regulation also includes transitionary provisions to address matters underway at the time of the changes coming into force.

## Evolving policy landscape: Bill 97 (Draft)

### City of Mississauga Corporate Report

10.2

May 1, 2023	Originator's files: LA.07-BIL
Mayor and Members of Council	
Andrew Whittemore, M.U.R.P., Commissioner of Planning & Building	Meeting date: May 3, 2023
,	Nayor and Members of Council Andrew Whittemore, M.U.R.P., Commissioner of

#### Subject

Bill 97 "Helping Home Buyers and Protecting Tenants" and Implications for City of Mississauga

#### PROPOSED PROVINCIAL POLICY STATEMENT, 2023

Since 2006, the Growth Plan helped to manage growth in the GGH by laying out an urban structure that aligned growth with infrastructure investments, promoted complete communities, a range and mix of housing forms, and protected lands for natural heritage, prime agriculture and employment. The PPS augmented the Growth Plan with broader based policy directions, again promoting a well-managed and balanced approach to growth province-wide. The proposed PPS, 2023, seems to be based on two assumptions. First, that there needs to be more residential land designated to meet growth targets. And second, an individual development application based approach to employment land-use changes is preferable to the current comprehensive review approach.

Staff disagree with both of these points and suggest the Province may not fully grasp the land economic implications of the proposed changes. Specifically, the changes could lead to an immediate spike in the land values in employment areas with prospective purchasers speculating on what higher financial return uses (e.g. residential) could possibly be considered on the sites. This land value uplift makes it more expensive for potential new businesses developing as-of-right uses to locate in the areas, thereby hurting overall economic growth.

Staff need greater clarification from the Province on many of the policies in the proposed PPS, 2023, to more fully understand how these changes will impact the city going forward. However, staff are concerned there could be significant impacts on the city's residential to non-residential assessment and population to employment ratios. It could impact the types of uses that could go into our employment areas, the commercial buffers that separate heavy industry from residential areas and the ability to maintain commercial uses in communities.



This is especially important in places where communities have experienced marginalization. In these places, the **"preservation of places that are significant for local indigenous populations or other marginalised groups – including ethnic and racial minorities, women, and LGBTQ people – has emancipatory potential**"

(Barber, 2013, pp. 95–96).

For residents and communities, heritage contributes to "affective attachments to place" through a creation and recreation of "a sense of belonging, past, place, culture and ownership"

(Stern, 2017, p. 296, citing Franklin and Crang, 2001)

it is important to question "<mark>what constitutes "heritage,"</mark> along with what kinds of heritage and whose heritage matters, and how to determine which spaces – whose spaces – merit protection and/or preservation"

(Ross, 2017, p. 32)



















# Case Study: Sagan Banquet Hall, Mississauga

Gulati Immigration Services

 $\odot$ ~~.

Google

0 100%

Region of Peel Park

MANPOWER

102.03

TOTAL STORE TO COME

300 843 CH

Kings Court Derry

A Contrained

Sayeda Khadija Centre - Masjid

Sagan Banquet Hall and Convention Centre

CALENCES OF



illumi 📀

6.

1

•

More info

€ Add to project

2D



"But because it's been here and in the industry for the past you know, 12 to 15 years, a lot of our bookings come from the parents and the grandparents and the references because the chefs we've had or have been here since day one. The food is the main thing that people look for. We don't do any advertisement at all ...

...we do get a lot of "Oh, my sister got married here". Or "my uncle got married here" that kind of thing."





"I would say about 60 to 70% are the Pakistani community ever since the Shaheen foods Center took over. And then, you know, 30 to 40% would be Indian/Gujarati community because that's from the previous owners, they were Gujarati and since the chefs are the same, they trust the food and you know, and then the rest 5-10% would be everybody else.

So for example, this Saturday we have an Eritrean party. Last week, Saturday, we had a Guyanese party, we get a lot of Guyanese, Trinidadian...The Eritrean party that we're hosting their cousin had their party here as well as their sister had their party..."

"So for our you know, Muslim clientele, we have to make sure that the meat is halal...For some of our Gujarati clientele, we need to make sure that they have a certain food requirement. No onion, no garlic. It's for our Jain guests. A lot of our Punjabi clienteles drink tea with their appetizer.

So just you know, little niche things that we have learned throughout the years to make sure everybody's on the same page."



"Hussein [the owner] usually talks to them in the language which gives them a sense of familiarity... it really gives the client that little like, "Okay, I'm home" kind of feel."



# Photo stories: Banquet halls in the GTA

These are photos taken at my mehndi and sangeet celebration. My husband is Punjabi but born and raised in Canada, and I'm Sindhi born in India raised in Dubai and have spent the larger part of my adult life in Canada. This celebration was our two families coming together just two days before our wedding to celebrate the beginning of our new life as husband and wife. Shilpa Mandhan @ Dreams Convention Centre SILLING

We got married in 2014 and wanted to do so by the water and in downtown Toronto. So, we were lucky to find space at Palais Royale along Lake Ontario. It is an amazing venue where the Rolling Stones and many other greats once performed.

The weather cooperated and allowed us to marry outdoors.

Amit Khera @ Palais Royale

Photo Credit: Tom Wang Photography



6.1

My husband and I got married when I was in law school and he was studying for to become a CPA. As both my husband and I were busy with exams that week, we essentially showed up to the wedding not knowing what to expect. Nonetheless, the celebration was full of joy and excitement, with a special emphasis on the delicious food and lively games. It was truly a day to remember!

Farzana Khan @ J&J Swagat 6.1



The Serbian community gathere d to celebrate a "mortgage burning." After 40 years, they paid off the mortgage for the construction of the All Serbian Saints Serbian Orthodox Church that stands beside the hall.

The location of the All Serbian Saints Serbian Orthodox Banquet Hall is important because it is a gathering place for the Serbian community in Southern Ontario. It is not only a place where religious ceremonies are held, but also a place where people can come together, eat, drink, dance, and share stories from the old country. Paying off the loan is significant as it marks a new chapter for the church and its community.

Elim Sly-Hooton @ All Serbian Saints Serbian Orthodox Banquet Hall

# Discussion: Identifying ways to recognize and protect banquet halls as sites of immigrant, intangible cultural heritage

## Heritage values - Interpretation

- 1. The property has design value or physical value because it is a rare, unique, representative or early example of a style, type, expression, material or construction method.
- 2. The property has design value or physical value because it displays a high degree of craftsmanship or artistic merit.
- 3. The property has design value or physical value because it demonstrates a high degree of technical or scientific achievement.
- 4. The property has historical value or **associative value because it has direct associations with a theme, event, belief, person, activity, organization or institution that is significant to a community.**
- 5. The property has historical value or associative value because it yields, or has the potential to yield, information that contributes to an understanding of a community or culture.
- 6. The property has historical value or associative value because it demonstrates or reflects the work or ideas of an architect, artist, builder, designer or theorist who is significant to a community.
- 7. The property has contextual value because it is important in defining, maintaining or supporting the character of an area.
- 8. The property has **contextual value because it is physically, functionally, visually or historically linked to its** surroundings.
- 9. The property has **contextual value because it is a landmark**

6.1

## Diversifying the heritage register

### Conflicts between heritage values and business interests

 Disconnect between the need to demonstrate associative value with one community versus business and multicultural interests

### Immigration histories and trajectories

- Problematic emphasis on age and the past when considering heritage designation, especially for newer immigrant/ethno-cultural communities with shorter histories of settlement in the city
- Need for emphasis on living heritage and conserving it for future generations

### Costs and benefits of designation

- Conflation of commemoration and preservation
- Transfer of costs onto businesses facing financial pressures post-COVID

### Need for emphasis on storytelling + engaging with residents about their everyday lives

- Emphasis on technical, objective reasoning over storytelling in designation processes
- Limited engagement with residents around places that are important to their daily lives

## What does heritage value?

### Emphasis on built or tangible heritage

- Lack of tangible ways to justify heritage designation based on intangible heritage
- Lack of precedents for preserving intangible cultural heritage/use of space over buildings
- Heritage designation tied to property, and property ownership does not account for rented spaces

### Purpose of designation

- Heritage preservation seen as a challenge or barrier to development
- Problematic approach to heritage designation for perpetuity

## **Process-related challenges**

- Emphasis on institutional, often-colonial records for documenting heritage values
- Changes to heritage designation process per Bill 23
- Lack of real protections through listing on heritage register

## Next steps: Policy case studies



Apply to join the Legacy Business

Check the status of your Legacy Business

Registry.

Registry application.

Apply for a Rent Stabilization Grant.

Legislation that supports Legacy

and contracts.

Businesses.

Become a City Supplier so you can get

money from the City. This includes grants

Some Legacy Businesses are compliant Suppliers that can do business with City departments. <u>See the list of Legacy</u> <u>Business City Suppliers</u>.

6.1

#### 44

Ahmad, Y. (2006). The Scope and Definitions of Heritage: From Tangible to Intangible. *International Journal of Heritage Studies*, 12(3), 292–300. Ashworth, G. (2011). Preservation, Conservation and Heritage: Approaches to the Past in the Present through the Built Environment. *Asian Anthropology*, 10(1), 1–18.

Barber, L. B. (2013). Making meaning of heritage landscapes: The politics of redevelopment in Halifax, Nova Scotia: Making meaning of heritage landscapes. *The Canadian Geographer / Le Géographe Canadien*, 57(1), 90–112.

Graham, B., Ashworth, G., & Tunbridge, J. (2016). A Geography of Heritage. Routledge.

Janssen, J., Luiten, E., Renes, H., & Stegmeijer, E. (2017). Heritage as sector, factor and vector: Conceptualizing the shifting relationship between heritage management and spatial planning. *European Planning Studies*, 25(9), 1654–1672.

Ludwig, C. (2016). From bricks and mortar to social heritage: Planning space for diversities in the AHD. International Journal of Heritage Studies, 22(10), 811–827.

Massey, D. (1995). Places and Their Pasts. History Workshop Journal, 39, 182–192.

McClelland, A., Peel, D., Hayes, C.-M., & Montgomery, I. (2013). A values-based approach to heritage planning: Raising awareness of the dark side of destruction and conservation. *Town Planning Review*, *84*(5), 583–604.

Minner, J. (2016). Revealing Synergies, Tensions, and Silences Between Preservation and Planning. Journal of the American Planning Association, 82(2), 72–87.

Rodwell, D. (2019). Urban heritage, communities, and environmental sustainability. In Securing Urban Heritage. Routledge.

Ross, S. G. (2017). Development versus Preservation Interests in the Making of a Music City: A Case Study of Select Iconic Toronto Music Venues and the Treatment of Their Intangible Cultural Heritage Value. International Journal of Cultural Property, 24(1), 31–56.

Ross, S. G. (2019). Law and Intangible Cultural Heritage in the City (1st ed.). Routledge. https://doi.org/10.4324/9780429288913

Stern, P. (2017). The Nature of Urban Heritage: The View from New Westminster, British Columbia. Anthropologica, 59(2), 295-309.

Vakhitova, T. V. (2015). Rethinking conservation: Managing cultural heritage as an inhabited cultural landscape. *Built Environment Project and Asset Management*, 5(2), 217–228.

van Knippenberg, K., Boonstra, B., & Boelens, L. (2022). Communities, Heritage and Planning: Towards a Co-Evolutionary Heritage Approach. *Planning Theory & Practice*, 23(1), 26–42.

Zukin, S. (1995). The Cultures of Cities. Blackwell.

# Thank you

This work would not have been possible without the generosity of banquet hall owners/managers, City of Mississauga staff, and my PhD supervisory committee.

Please keep in touch at sneha.mandhan@mail.utoronto.ca