

# City of Mississauga Corporate Report



<p>Date: September 2, 2020</p> <p>To: Chair and Members of Heritage Advisory Committee</p> <p>From: Shari Lichterman, CPA, CMA, Commissioner of Community Services</p>	<p>Originator's files:</p> <hr/> <p>Meeting date: September 22, 2020</p>
--	--

## Subject

**Request to Demolish two properties: 2182 Corsair Road and 2465 Shepard Avenue (Ward 7)**

## Recommendation

1. That the property at 2465 Shepard Avenue, which is listed on the City's Heritage Register, is not worthy of heritage designation, and consequently, that the City's Park Planning Section's request to demolish proceed through the applicable process, as per the Corporate Report from the Commissioner of Community Services dated September 2, 2020.
2. That the property at 2182 Corsair Road, which is not listed on the City's Heritage Register, meets the requirements of having Cultural Heritage Value and Interest under the *Ontario Heritage Act*.
3. That the Cultural Heritage Value and Interest for 2182 Corsair Road be satisfied through an interpretation and commemoration plan and that the City's Park Planning Section's request to demolish proceeds through the applicable process, as per the Corporate Report from the Commissioner of Community Services dated September 2, 2020.

## Report Highlights

- The City's Park Planning Section has acquired the properties at 2182 Corsair Road and 2465 Shepard Avenue as future parkland.
- 2465 Shepard Avenue is on the City's Heritage Register. It is a two-storey structure built in the Georgian Revival Style and was built in 1924 by George Shepard. It has been significantly altered and is a poor example of its architectural style.
- 2182 Corsair Road is not on the City's Heritage Register. It was built in 1969 for Marjorie Hancock, sister of Macklin Hancock, and sits on the east side of the Hancock Woodlands. It is a good example of West Coast Modernism architectural style in Mississauga.

- Park Planning seeks to address the architectural, contextual and associative historical value of the structure through commemoration and interpretation within the Hancock Woodlands Park and through the adaptive re-use of salvageable material from the structure as a park design feature.

## Background

### 2465 Shepard Avenue

Section 27.3 of the Ontario Heritage Act states that structures or buildings on property listed on the City's Heritage Register cannot be removed or demolished without at least 60 days' notice to Council. This legislation allows time for Council to review the property's cultural heritage value to determine if the property merits designation.

The property at 2465 Shepard Avenue is owned by the City of Mississauga. The property was purchased as part of the Cooksville Parkland Acquisition program in order to help address the deficit of parkland in the Cooksville area. Park Planning is seeking to demolish the structure in order that the lands can be used for parkland purposes. (Appendix 1). The property consists of a two-storey Georgian Revival style house built in 1924 for George Shepard, grandson of Jacob Creek.

The Heritage Impact Assessment report (Appendix 2) submitted for this property notes that the house is a typical style of house built to emulate the Georgian Mansions, such as the Elliot-Cawthra House, but on a much smaller scale. The house itself is in poor condition and many of heritage elements, including the stucco exterior and original woodwork on the doors and windows are poorly maintained. The decorative ironwork which once lined the front door has been removed and is lost. The report concludes that many of the heritage elements of this structure have been lost and are not restorable, and furthermore the information obtained by the City's own departments notes that the structure is under threat of reoccurring flooding from Cooksville Creek.

The Heritage Impact Assessment Report recommends that the property does not have sufficient cultural heritage value and interest to warrant the extensive measures required to re-locate and restore the house.

### 2182 Corsair Road

Section 7.4.1.12 of the Mississauga Official Plan states that: "The proponent of any construction, development, or property alteration that might adversely affect a listed or designated cultural heritage resource or which proposed adjacent to a cultural heritage resource will be required to submit a Heritage Impact Assessment, prepared to the satisfaction of the City and other appropriate authorities having jurisdiction."

The property at 2182 Corsair Road is owned by the City of Mississauga and is adjacent to the Hancock Woodlands Park, which is listed on the City's Heritage Register. Park Planning is seeking to demolish the structure as part of the long term goal to add parkland and expand

Hancock Woodlands Park (Appendix 1). The property consists of a single storey West Coast Modern structure custom-built in 1969 for Marjorie Hancock.

The Hancocks operated a nursery throughout the twentieth century on the adjacent property, now a City-owned park. Macklin Hancock is widely considered to be the ‘father’ of landscape architecture in Ontario. He was renowned for his design of complete neighbours in the 1950s and 60s, including the Meadowvale neighbourhood in Mississauga and the Don Mills ‘Peanut’ in Toronto. This design work took place within ‘The Office’, a mid-century modernist bunker located within the present-day Hancock Woodlands Park. Marjorie, his sister, was an artist and nurserywoman. Together they oversaw the nursery business begun by their father.

The Marjorie Hancock House was built on the east side of the Hancock property and overlooked the woodlands. The structure was built into the landscape, similar to ‘The Office’ as one of Macklin’s principal philosophies regarding the position of the built form within nature. The house is built in the West Coast Modernism style, popular in the mid-twentieth century.

The structure is further designed to be set in nature through the use of natural materials in its construction. The structure is primary wood, with stone, and the entire back wall is glass, to give the impression that the structure continues into nature. There are extensive and mature gardens planted around the property.

Park Planning first evaluated the structure for its cultural heritage value and interest in 2011 with a Heritage Impact Statement for the entire Hancock Woodlands property, including 2182 Corsair Road (Appendix 3). The assessment report recommended that all structures within the property, including the Marjorie Hancock House, be designated under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*. However, the 2011 Heritage Impact Statement did not provide adequate analysis for the requirements under Regulation 9/06 of the Ontario Heritage Act, which is the regulation which provides guidance on establishing the cultural heritage value and interest for a property.

Prior to submitting an application to demolish the structure, Park Planning undertook a property-specific Heritage Impact Assessment for the Marjorie Hancock house (Appendix 4). The attached report notes that the Marjorie Hancock House meets all the requirements under regulation 9/06 of the *Ontario Heritage Act* for having cultural heritage value and interest, and that if the structure cannot be saved from demolition than the heritage interest for the property must be addressed through the following:

- Documentation through a complete architectural report for the property;
- Salvage of viable heritage elements from the house; and
- Adaptive re-use of these salvaged elements in a commemoration of Marjorie Hancock, the house and the history of the property.

## Comments

The City’s Park Planning Section has requested permission to demolish the structures at 2465 Shepard Avenue and 2182 Corsair Road. The Heritage Impact Assessment for 2465 Shepard Avenue notes that the house meets regulation 9/06 of the Ontario Heritage Act as the house

was built for George Shepard, the grandson of Jacob Creek. The report also notes that the house is in poor condition and does not merit the efforts required to preserve it. Staff concur with these findings as there are other, more notable and better preserved houses of a similar style within the City.

The Heritage Impact Assessment for 2182 Corsair Road notes that the structure meets all the requirements under Regulation 9/06 of the *Ontario Heritage Act* and concludes that the property has cultural heritage value and interest. However, it also notes that the property is not included in the City's Heritage Register.

The primary option for such structures is designation under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act. However, the report does note that there is evidence that the structure is beginning to degrade, noting that the roof beams show indication of past leaks and window seals have degraded. Although the structure is still in acceptable condition it is beginning to deteriorate and would require significant investment.

A memo from Park Planning to Heritage Planning (Appendix 1) outlines the challenges of retaining and adaptively re-using the structure as is within Hancock Woodlands Park. The memo also notes that Park Planning, in conjunction with other City departments, has carried out a search for a use of this structure. Despite a diligent search through internal sources no viable use has been identified.

Moving the structure in order to retain it would be counter to the concepts of its placement in this particular context and would irrevocably diminish the heritage value of the house for the sake of preserving it.

The Heritage Impact Assessment notes that alternate strategies such as 'mothballing' the structure for future use adds to endangering the structure itself, as it would require regular maintenance and security within the park.

The structure meets Regulation 9/06 in all three ways. It is architecturally unique within its suburban setting and there are no other West Coast Modern houses within this part of the City.

It has contextual value as it was designed and built to be part of the surrounding landscape and blends into the surrounding woodlands in such a manner as to provide a transitory experience from being inside a house to also being in nature.

Finally, the structure has historical associative value as it was custom built for use by the Hancock family within the overall property which includes the woodland and their former nurseries.

The Heritage Impact Assessment report recommends that these three aspects of cultural heritage value and interest can be respected through means other than designating and preserving the structure.

Firstly, the report recommends a detailed architectural study and salvage plan of the viable heritage elements prior to the demolition of the structure. Elements that could be salvaged and re-used could be removed and set aside during demolition. Staff note that all the original architectural plans for the house are documented, reducing the need for an architectural study as part of the salvage plan.

Secondly, salvaged elements of the house should be used to create in park design features at the site. . It is highly recommended that park design features be designed in a manner that reflects the form of West Coast Modern architecture and of the manner in which the house was built into the landscape.

Finally, Park Planning has already established a plan to preserve other heritage listed buildings within the property, including 'The Office' and "The Header House". The Heritage Impact Assessment submitted in support of the demolition application notes "The Office (1951) located on the Hancock Woodlands site provides opportunities to showcase relationships between the Marjorie Hancock, Macklin Hancock and progressive Canadian architecture in the 1950s & 60s".

The recommendations for the Marjorie Hancock House provide an alternative strategy which seeks to bring the heritage resources and history of the property and render them more accessible to the public than simply preserving the house. The elements of the house; and materials, would be preserved in the form of a park design feature within the property itself. The landscape and woodlands surrounding the Marjorie Hancock house, another heritage element, will remain and will not be impacted by their inclusion into the park. Finally, the history of the Hancock family will be commemorated through interpretative signage and materials throughout the park, focusing on 'The Office' and "The Header House".

Having reviewed the Heritage Impact Assessment and proposed interpretation and commemoration plan for the Marjorie Hancock House and the Hancock Woodland Park generally, staff agree with the recommendation that the house can be demolished as the heritage resources are respected through other means that are potentially more appropriate and accessible to the public.

## Financial Impact

The cost for demolition of the structures at 2182 Corsair Road and 2465 Shepard Avenue, as well as the salvage, commemoration and interpretation work of the Marjorie Hancock House is covered under the existing Park Development and Hancock Woodlands Park budgets. This report reflects only the execution of Council's responsibilities under the Ontario Heritage Act with relation to the demolition of both structures.

## Conclusion

Park Planning has applied for the demolition of structures at two properties; 2465 Shepard Avenue and 2182 Corsair Road. The property on Shepard Avenue is listed on the City's

Heritage Register. The property on Corsair Road, the Marjorie Hancock House, is not listed on the Heritage Register but it is adjacent to the Hancock Woodlands Park and is part of the former Hancock family property. The applicant has submitted documentation reports which provide information which does not support the buildings' merit for designation under the *Ontario Heritage Act* but does support the salvage, commemoration and interpretation of the Marjorie Hancock House within the development of the Hancock Woodlands Park. Staff concur with these findings, and recommend that the demolition of the house at 2465 Shepard Avenue proceed and that the following recommendations apply with regards to the demolition of the Marjorie Hancock House at 2182 Corsair Road:

1. Park Planning will execute a salvage plan during the demolition of the Marjorie Hancock House. All viable heritage elements identified in the salvage plan will be set aside and protected during demolition.
2. The salvaged heritage elements will be adaptively re-used on the property as a park design feature which will be based on the form of West Coast Modernism architecture and architectural landscape principals evocative of the work of Macklin Hancock.
3. The Hancock family history and the history of the property are to be interpreted and celebrated within the balance of the park, focusing on 'The Office' and "The Header House" structure.

## Attachments

Appendix 1: Memorandum- Intended Future Parkland Use of 2182 Corsair Rd. and 2465 Shepard Ave

Appendix 2: Heritage Impact Assessment- 2465 Shepard Avenue

Appendix 3: Landplan 2011 Hancock Woodlands Heritage Impact Statement

Appendix 4: 2020 Heritage Impact Assessment- 2182 Corsair Road



Shari Lichterman, CPA, CMA, Commissioner of Community Services

Prepared by: John Dunlop, Manager, Heritage Planning and Indigenous Relations